### **NSW ICAC Operation Paragon**

## **Recommendations for prosecutions**

#### 7 March 2023



The Commission must seek the advice of the Director of Public Prosecutions (DPP) on whether any prosecution should be commenced. The DPP determines whether any criminal charges can be laid, and conducts all prosecutions. The Commission provides information on this website in relation to the status of prosecution recommendations and outcomes as advised by the DPP. The progress of matters is generally within the hands of the DPP. Accordingly, the Commission does not directly notify persons affected of advice received from the DPP or the progress of their matters generally.

The Commission is of the opinion that consideration should be given to obtaining the advice of the DPP with respect to the prosecution of:

#### **Alexandre Dubois**

- for offences under s 249B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act 1900 ("the Crimes Act") of, between June 2010 and June 2019, corruptly soliciting and receiving benefits, as an inducement or reward for using his position to award contracts to Complete Building Fitout Pty Ltd, CBF Projects Pty Ltd, Euro Civil and Maintenance Pty Ltd ("Euro Civil") and OzCorp Civil Pty Ltd (chapter 2)
- for an offence under s 249B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between April 2011 and November 2012, corruptly soliciting and receiving benefits, on account of using his position to award contracts to TTS Group Investments Pty Ltd ("TTS Group") and MWK Developments Pty Ltd (chapter 3)
- for an offence under s 192E(1)(b) of the Crimes Act of, in relation to his conduct between November 2012 and July 2013, engaging in a deception to dishonestly obtain a financial advantage from Roads and Maritime Services ("the RMS") through the awarding of RMS contracts to MWK Developments (chapter 3)
- for an offence under s 249C(1) of the Crimes Act of, in relation to his conduct between April 2011 and July 2013, being the agent of both the Roads and Traffoc Authority (RTA)/RMS, giving to the RTA/RMS documents, namely, quotes and invoices from both TTS Group and MWK Developments, which were false or misleading in a material respect with the intent to defraud the RTA/RMS (chapter 3)
- for an offence under s 192G(b) of the Crimes Act of, in relation to his conduct on about 6 April 2011, dishonestly publishing a statement, namely, a tender evaluation report, being false or misleading in a material respect, with the intention of obtaining a financial advantage (chapter 3)
- for an offence under s 249B(2)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between March 2011 and July 2011, corruptly soliciting or receiving a benefit as an inducement or reward for showing favour to a company controlled by Tilal Rifai, in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA (chapter 4)
- for an offence under s 249B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between May 2010 and June 2011, corruptly receiving benefits as a reward for using his position in the RTA to award contracts to BMN Electrical Services Pty Ltd ("BMN Electrical") (chapter 5)

- for offences under s 249B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between January 2011 and October 2012, corruptly soliciting and receiving benefits, on account of using his position in the RTA/RMS, as a reward for causing the awarding of contracts to A&A Structural Solutions Pty Ltd ("A&A Structural") and Senai Steel Pty Ltd (chapter 6)
- for offences under s 249B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between September 2011 and June 2019, corruptly soliciting and receiving benefits, on account of using his position in the RTA/RMS, to award contracts to Areva Corp Pty Ltd, Seina Group Pty Ltd and Efficient Project Management and Deliveries Pty Ltd ("EPMD") (chapter 7)
- for an offence under s 249B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between January 2013 and April 2014, corruptly soliciting and receiving benefits, on account of using his position in the RMS to award contracts to MJ Wilsons Pty Ltd (chapter 8)
- for offences under s 249C(1) of the Crimes Act of, between January 2013 and March 2014, using documents, namely, quotes and invoices on behalf of MJ Wilsons, which were false or misleading in a material respect with the intent to defraud the RMS (chapter 8)
- for an offence under s 249C(1) of the Crimes Act of using a document, namely, a letter dated 7 April 2014 purportedly from Mark Abraham, which was false or misleading in a material respect with the intent to defraud the RMS (chapter 8)
- for an offence under s 192E(1)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between January 2013 and April 2014, conspiring with, or aiding and abetting, John Goldberg in the commission of deception to dishonestly obtain a financial advantage through the awarding of contracts to MJ Wilsons (chapter 8)
- for offences under s 249B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between December 2012 and December 2018, aiding and abetting Craig Steyn in corruptly soliciting and receiving benefits, on account of using his position to award contracts to CBF Projects, Euro Civil and OzCorp Civil (chapter 14)

## **Craig Steyn**

- for offences under s 249B(1) of the Crimes Act in relation to the benefits he solicited and received from Joseph Rahme on account of using his position in the RMS to arrange for the awarding of RMS contracts to Lancomm Pty Ltd (chapter 11)
- for offences under s 249B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between February 2013 and June 2019, corruptly soliciting and receiving benefits, on account of using his position to award contracts to AA Steel Piping Pty Ltd ("AA Steel") (chapter 12)
- for two offences under s 87 of the ICAC Act of giving false and misleading evidence when he said during his compulsory examination on 9 September 2020:
  - that he borrowed \$100,000 from the Alexanders from their contributions to the cost of works on his home of which he repaid \$20,000 (chapter 12)
  - o that he never received payments from contractors (chapter 12)
- for offences under s 249B(1) of the Crimes Act of, between December 2016 and June 2019, corruptly soliciting and receiving benefits from Steven Masters on account of using his position in the RMS to arrange for the awarding of RMS contracts to S A Masters Electrical Services ("S A Masters") (chapter 13)
- for offences under s 249B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between December 2012 and December 2018, corruptly soliciting and receiving benefits, on account of using his position to award contracts to CBF Projects, Euro Civil and OzCorp Civil (chapter 14)

### **Chahid Chahine**

- for offences under s 249B(2)(a) or s 249B(2)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between June 2010 and June 2019, corruptly giving a benefit to Mr Dubois on account of Mr Dubois showing favour to Mr Chahine, Mr Hadid and companies under their control, namely, Complete Building Fitout, CBF Projects, Euro Civil and OzCorp Civil (collectively "their companies") in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS, or the receipt of or expectation of which would tend to influence Mr Dubois to show favour to Mr Chahine and Barrak Hadid and their companies in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS (chapter 2)
- for an offence under s 193B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between December 2012 and September 2013, conspiring with, or aiding and abetting, Mr Goldberg and Mr Hadid in knowingly dealing with proceeds of crime, namely, that Mr Goldberg received illicit payments into the Wilkins Corp Pty Ltd bank accounts from the CBF Projects account, an account controlled by Mr Chahine and Mr Hadid, for the purpose of those proceeds being provided by Mr Goldberg to Mr Dubois (chapter 8)
- for offences under s 249B(2)(a) or s 249B(2)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between December 2012 and November 2017, corruptly giving a benefit to Mr Steyn on account of Mr Steyn showing favour to Mr Hadid, Mr Chahine and their companies in relation to the affairs or business of the RMS, or the receipt of or expectation of which would tend to influence Mr Steyn to show favour to Mr Chahine and Mr Hadid and their companies in relation to the affairs or business of the RMS (chapter 14)

#### **Barrak Hadid**

- for offences under s 249B(2)(a) or s 249B(2)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between June 2010 and June 2019, corruptly giving a benefit to Mr Dubois on account of Mr Dubois showing favour to Mr Hadid, Mr Chahine and their companies in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS, or the receipt of or expectation of which would tend to influence Mr Dubois to show favour to Mr Hadid and Mr Chahine and their companies in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS (chapter 2)
- for an offence under s 193B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between December 2012 and September 2013, conspiring with, or aiding and abetting, Mr Goldberg and Mr Chahine in knowingly dealing with proceeds of crime, namely, that Mr Goldberg received illicit payments into the Wilkins Corp Pty Ltd bank accounts from the CBF Projects account, an account controlled by Mr Chahine and Mr Hadid, for the purpose of those proceeds being provided by Mr Goldberg to Mr Dubois (chapter 8)
- for offences under s 249B(2)(a) or s 249B(2)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between December 2012 and December 2018, corruptly giving a benefit to Mr Steyn on account of Mr Steyn showing favour to Mr Hadid, Mr Chahine and their companies in relation to the affairs or business of the RMS, or the receipt of or expectation of

which would tend to influence Mr Steyn to show favour to Mr Hadid and Mr Chahine and their companies in relation to the affairs or business of the RMS (chapter 14)

#### **Towfik Taha**

- for offences under s 249B(2)(a) or s 249B(2)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between April 2011 and November 2012, corruptly giving a benefit to Mr Dubois on account of Mr Dubois showing favour to Mr Taha and TTS Group and MWK Developments, companies under his control or joint control, in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS, or the receipt of or expectation of which would tend to influence Mr Dubois to show favour to Mr Taha and TTS Group in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS (chapter 3)
- for an offence under s 193B(1)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between May 2011 and November 2012, dealing with proceeds of crime knowing that it was proceeds of crime and intending to conceal proceeds of crime, in that Mr Taha created the MWK Developments bank accounts under his name for the purpose of allowing Mr Dubois access to illicit payments made into that account by other RTA/RMS contractors (chapter 3)
- for an offence under s 87 of the ICAC Act of giving false and misleading evidence when he said during his compulsory examination on 2 December 2020 that he never provided a "kickback" to Mr Dubois (chapter 3)

#### Tilal Rifai

• for an offence under s 249B(2)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between March 2011 and July 2011, corruptly giving a benefit to Mr Dubois on account of Mr Dubois showing favour to Mr Rifai and United Demolition Excavation Group Pty Ltd ("UDE Group") in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA (chapter 4)

#### **Bilal Najjarin**

 for an offence under s 249(B)(2)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between May 2010 and June 2011, corruptly giving benefits to Mr Dubois on account of Mr Dubois showing favour to Mr Najjarin and BMN Electrical in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA (chapter 5)

# **Abdula Nachabe**

for offences under s 249B(2)(a) or s 249B(2)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between January 2011 and October 2012, corruptly giving benefits, on account of Mr Dubois showing favour to Abdula Nachabe, Gamele Nachabe, A&A Structural and Senai Steel in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS, or receipt of or expectation of which would tend to influence Mr Dubois to show favour to Abdula Nachabe, Gamele Nachabe and A&A Structural and Senai Steel in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS (chapter 6)

### **Gamele Nachabe**

• for an offence under s 249B(2)(a) or s 249B(2)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between January 2012 and October 2012, corruptly giving benefits, on account of Mr Dubois showing favour to Gamele Nachabe, Abdula Nachabe and Senai Steel in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA, or receipt of or expectation of which would tend to influence Mr Dubois to show favour to Gamele Nachabe, Abdula Nachabe and Senai Steel in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA (chapter 6)

## **Hassan Alameddine**

- for offences under s 249B(2)(a) or s 249B(2)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between September 2011 and June 2019, corruptly giving a benefit to Mr Dubois on account of Mr Dubois showing favour to Hassan Alameddine and companies under his control in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS, or the receipt of or expectation of which would tend to influence Mr Dubois to show favour to Hassan Alameddine and his companies in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS (chapter 7)
- for an offence under s 193B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between January 2013 and May 2013, conspiring with, or aiding and abetting, Mr Goldberg in knowingly dealing with proceeds of crime, namely, that Mr Goldberg received illicit payments into the Ibrahim Transport Pty Ltd bank accounts from Hassan Alameddine's Areva Corp bank account for the purpose of those proceeds being provided by Mr Goldberg to Mr Dubois (chapter 8)

# John Goldberg

- for offences under s 249B(2)(a) or s 249B(2)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between January 2013 and April 2014, corruptly giving benefits to Mr Dubois on account of Mr Dubois showing favour to Mr Goldberg and MJ Wilsons in relation to the affairs or business of the RMS, or the receipt of or expectation of which would tend to influence Mr Dubois to show favour to Mr Goldberg and MJ Wilsons in relation to the affairs or business of the RMS (chapter 8)
- for an offence under s 192E(1)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between January 2013 and April 2014, conspiring with, or aiding and abetting, Mr Dubois in the commission of deception to dishonestly obtain a financial advantage through the awarding of contracts to MJ Wilsons (chapter 8)
- for an offence under s 193B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between December 2012 and September 2013, conspiring with, or aiding and abetting, Mr Hadid and Mr Chahine in knowingly dealing with proceeds of crime, namely that Mr Goldberg received illicit payments into the Wilkins Corp bank accounts from CBF Projects and withdrew those proceeds and provided them to Mr Dubois (chapter 8)
- for an offence under s 193B(1)(a) of the Crimes Act of, between January 2013 and May 2013, conspiring with, or aiding and abetting, Hassan Alameddine in knowingly dealing with proceeds of crime, namely that Mr Goldberg received illicit payments into the Ibrahim Transport bank accounts from Hassan Alameddine's Areva Corp bank account and withdrew those proceeds and provided them to Mr Dubois (chapter 8)

- for two offences under s 87 of the ICAC Act for giving false and misleading evidence when he said during his compulsory examination on 1 December 2020:
  - that he had no knowledge that Mr Dubois awarded RMS contracts in return for "kickbacks" (chapter 8)
  - that the first time he heard Mr Dubois was giving RMS contracts for "kickbacks" was when he was giving evidence during that hearing (chapter 8)

## **Ashley Alexander**

- for offences under s 249B(2)(a) or s 249B(2)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between February 2013 and June 2019, corruptly giving a benefit to Mr Steyn on account of Mr Steyn showing favour to Mr Alexander and Mrs Alexander and their company, AA Steel, in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS, or the receipt of or expectation of which would tend to influence Mr Steyn to show favour to Mr Alexander and Mrs Alexander and AA Steel in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS (chapter 12)
- for an offence under s 87 of the ICAC Act of giving false and misleading evidence when he said during his compulsory examination on 13 October 2020 that the payments he and AA Steel made to Mr Steyn were a loan (chapter 12)

#### Sandra Alexander

• for offences under s 249B(2)(a) or s 249B(2)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between February 2013 and June 2019, corruptly giving a benefit to Mr Steyn on account of Mr Steyn showing favour to Mr Alexander and Mrs Alexander and their company, AA Steel, in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS, or the receipt of or expectation of which would tend to influence Mr Steyn to show favour to Mr Alexander and Mrs Alexander and AA Steel in relation to the affairs or business of the RTA/RMS (chapter 12)

### **Steven Masters**

• for offences under s 249B(2)(a) or s 249B(2)(b) of the Crimes Act of, between December 2016 and June 2019, corruptly giving a benefit to Mr Steyn on account of Mr Steyn showing favour to Mr Masters and his business, S A Masters, in relation to the affairs or business of the RMS, or the receipt of or expectation of which would tend to influence Mr Steyn to show favour to Mr Masters and S A Masters in relation to the affairs or business of the RMS (chapter 13).